

**Supplemental
Communications (1)**
(Received before 12pm
October 17)

Supplemental Communications



October 13, 2023

**BRIDGE HOUSING
CORPORATION**

BRIDGE PROPERTY
MANAGEMENT COMPANY

BAY AREA SENIOR SERVICES, INC.

BRIDGE ECONOMIC
DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

Subject: North Berkeley Housing Partners Request for Modifications to Objective Design Standards to Ensure Financial Feasibility and Buildability

Dear Planning Commissioners:

The members of North Berkeley Housing Partners, including non-profit affordable housing developers BRIDGE Housing, Insight Housing, and East Bay Asian Local Development Corp. (EBALDC), and our market-rate partner AvalonBay Communities were proud to be selected by BART to develop the North Berkeley BART Station. Collectively, our three affordable housing firms have built more than 100 affordable housing buildings across the Bay Area. We look forward to delivering a completed project that reflects the vision and priorities of the Berkeley community – one that is livable, walkable, and creatively designed.

We have listened closely to the feedback received by members of the community on our project’s design and made modifications to incorporate this input. We have also worked closely with City of Berkeley staff to develop the Objective Design Standards (ODS) that will guide development at the North Berkeley BART site. These discussions have helped to shape the proposed design of our project. We are now proceeding to the next level of detailed design and financial feasibility analysis for the purpose of our upcoming permit application to the City. As we enter this more detailed level of design, we have concerns that certain aspects of the ODS as drafted will likely pose barriers to the buildability and financial feasibility for both our planned market-rate and affordable-housing buildings. This will make it harder to deliver the market-rate homes and affordable housing fee revenue anticipated by the City and community. For the affordable housing buildings, we are concerned that these specific aspects of the ODS could drive up the cost per unit, which would have the deleterious effect of making our project less competitive for state affordable housing funding and could unduly prolong an already lengthy timeline for project completion.

While the ODS is underpinned by sound design principles, we fear that it errs on the side of being overly prescriptive. In order to plan for buildable and feasible buildings, we respectfully request greater flexibility in certain areas, specified below:



- **Section 1.3 Building Setbacks** Recommend reducing required setbacks to the minimum required by zoning of five feet to provide greater design flexibility. We believe that the planting buffer, sidewalks, and a setback of five feet minimum provide ample separation between the buildings and the street. This change will allow for more creative design and more flexibility, if needed, to achieve financial feasibility.
 - **Projections:** Recommend projections provided for on Sacramento Street to apply on Virginia Street.
- **Section 2.2 Building Massing and Articulation** Recommend simplifying major breaks in order to better provide family-sized units:
 - Increase maximum primary facade length to 250' for Delaware, Acton and Virginia streets.
 - Simplify by eliminating maximum secondary facade length, as the length is already limited to 300' by block sizes and given they are secondary that should be sufficient.
 - **Section 2.2.3 Major Breaks** should only apply to facades greater than 200' in length (increase from 150').
 - Major Breaks in secondary facades should be eliminated as they are already recessed and have primary facades with breaks in front of them.
 - Minor breaks would still apply to all facades and would inspire design creativity.
- **Section 2.3.2 Materials** - We support the use of high-quality materials and the requirement to use at least two materials on each exterior; however, the 65 percent limit for a single material is too low. We recommend that it be increased to 80 percent and that the percentage apply to all building exteriors as a whole. Further, recommend removing the requirement that panel systems shall not have exposed fasteners as many premium facade systems have exposed fasteners.
- **Section 2.3.3 Utility/Refuse/Loading Access** - Recommend eliminating these added requirements, as they are overly prescriptive and could adversely impact “back-of-house” access to these buildings. We believe these issues are adequately addressed by the zoning standards and access study and further restrictions could affect long-term operating costs, especially for the smaller affordable buildings.

We look forward to our continued partnership with the City of Berkeley to deliver homes that live up to the promise and potential of this site.

Respectfully,
North Berkeley Housing Partners



Page 3 of 3

North Berkeley Housing Partners Request for Modifications to Objective Design Standards to Ensure Financial Feasibility and Buildability

For North Berkeley Housing Partners:



Jonathan Stern, Director - Acquisition & Planning
BRIDGE Housing



Calleene Egan, CEO
Insight Housing



Liz Probst, Director of Real Estate Development
East Bay Asian Local Development Corp. (EBALDC)



Joe Kirchofer, Senior Vice President
AvalonBay Communities



Supplemental Communications

From: cafred1@juno.com
Sent: Monday, October 9, 2023 3:20 PM
To: Klein, Jordan
Subject: Please Confirm Receipt of N Berkeley BART Development Comments I Sent Ms. Shen on 9/28/2023

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

10-9-2023
To Jordan Klein
Director Of Planning
City of Berkeley

Hello Mr. Klein,
Please confirm receipt of comments concerning the planned North Berkeley BART development, and the need for a new EIR for the project that I emailed to Alisa Shen on September 28, 2023.
I am enclosing my comments here.
Thank you very much.
Clifford Fred
Berkeley Calif.

September 28, 2023
From Clifford Fred
Berkeley Calif.

NORTH BERKELEY BART DEVELOPMENT MUCH TOO TALL AND DENSE FOR THE SITE THE PROJECT NEEDS A NEW ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT

To Alisa Shen,
City of Berkeley Planning Department

Hello Ms. Shen,

THE PROJECT IS TOO BIG & TOO DENSE

The development is far too big and too dense for the development. City officials falsely state that the project has to be 7 or 8 stories or more. This is not true. It can be much small i.e. 2-3 stories if that is what BART agrees to develop. The project as proposed would overwhelm the existing neighborhood, make life miserable during construction and afterwards, and would drive down property values.

EIR ISSUES – A new EIR is needed for the North Berkeley BART development

In April 2022 the Berkeley Planning Commission approved an EIR for the zoning amendment it adopted at the same meeting for the North Berkeley & Ashby BART site. The Berkeley City Council approved the EIR & the zoning amendment in June 2022

In the past year and a half, there has been a very considerable amount of high-rise & large scale new apartment construction applied for, approved but not yet built, or approved & now under construction that was not considered in the April 2022 BART zoning EIR. Included is a 26 story apt high rise at 2161 Allston Way, and a 28 story apartment high rise at Shattuck and University Ave.

A new 14 story apartment complex planned at 2109 Miliva Street.

The removal of 500 or more parking spaces at the North Berkeley BART lot is a new development since EIR approved in April 2022

Also since April 2022, new up-zoning & more dense zoning proposal for the large southside area south of the UC campus have been announced at the Planning Commission. And the City Council recently stated it wants even taller & more dense buildings downtown than currently allowed. And recently a planning process to allow taller and more dense construction on San Pablo Ave. in Berkeley has begun.

And a new Housing Element for the City's General Plan was adopted earlier this year, which allows & encourages 9000 more housing units to be built, beyond what is currently under construction or approved but not yet built.

And, a Hopkins Corridor Plan that would remove over 150 street parking spaces on Hopkins Street just a few blocks from the N. Berkeley BART station has been proposed by City officials. Although the Plan was recently tabled, it has not been cancelled.

The Ohlone Greenway Modernization and Safety Project would remove more parking spaces in the vicinity and would encourage more bicycle-pedestrian & e-scooter collisions by not providing a separate pedestrian pathway.

A massive square block student housing development on Monroe Street nearby in Albany will add considerable more traffic to the already congested northwest Berkeley neighborhood surrounding the BART station.

San Pablo Avenue Planning :

The City is in the midst of a planning process to increase height and density limits along San Pablo Avenue in Berkeley, which is just a very few blocks from the BART station lot. More development along San Pablo Ave will further exacerbate the cumulative impacts of the North Berkeley BART development.

EVACUATION AND RESPONSE TIME STUDY

The Berkeley Fire Department has retained consultants to produce an Evacuation and Response Time Study. Planners should know that more development causes more traffic congestion, which results in longer response times by the Fire Department to fires and health emergencies, which thus leads to more fatalities.

The North Berkeley BART and Ashby BART, as well as all other large scale and high rise pending developments in Berkeley should be put on hold until the Fire Department's Evacuation and Response Time Study is completed and available for review.

Thus, the cumulative impacts of the proposed BART development, combined with all the reasonably foreseeable and anticipated development in the surrounding community would be far worse at the time BART & BRIDGE have specific development plans ready 6-8 months from now than was considered in the EIR that the Planning Commission approved in April 2022.

Thus clearly a new project specific EIR is needed for the North Berkeley (and Ashby BART) developments, to properly analyze and mitigate the cumulative impacts of the project(s) and all the reasonable foreseeable development that is now in the works.

The April 2022 zoning EIR is already antiquated due to the rapid pace of new development being proposed, approved and built in Berkeley, and the unrelenting push to allow taller and more dense development that is currently allowed.

THERE SHOULD BE THERE BE FURTHER CITY REVIEW

An independent 3rd party should be retained to determine if BART's final development proposal meets or exceeds what is allowed by the site's zoning.

If the proposed BART development is deemed to meet the parameters of the new zoning, then BART should still have to prepare a new project specific EIR, just as UC has to prepare EIRs for its new development projects.

But if the project is deemed to be beyond the parameters of the 2022 zoning, and City of Berkeley discretionary approval is needed, then the City of Berkeley should have to prepare a project specific EIR.

OPEN SPACE

There is no BART/Bridge commitment to any significant amount of open space in the project, which could house well over 1000 people. The nearest park, the relatively small Cedar Rose Park is already extremely crowded most days and always on weekends. It cannot absorb the over 1000 people who would live at the N. Berkeley BART development.

Measure L – the Public Open Space Ballot Initiative that was adopted by Berkeley voters in November 1986, calls for a study of every area of Berkeley to determine its open space needs and for the acquisition of new open space to meet these needs. This needs to be done for the greater northwest Berkeley neighborhood before any more planning is done for the development at the North Berkeley BART station.

THE DEMAND FOR ALL THIS HOUSING DOES NOT EXIST

At the May 10, 2023 meeting at the North Berkeley Senior Center, BART Director R. Saltzman did not dispute that the market rent for these units would be in the \$6000 range. The Bridge consultants I spoke with did not dispute that the local rental market is soft, that rents are not going up, and that there are apartments for rent all over Berkeley.

Yet, there are many thousands of apartments units in Berkeley that have been recently built, are under construction, approved but not yet under construction, or in the pipeline, throughout the Berkeley flatlands. Included are a 25 story apt building at 2190 Shattuck, a 28 story apt building at the NW corner of Shattuck & University, and at 26 story apt building at 2161 Allston Way.

The pace of approval and construction is relentless, even though the demand for all this housing does not exist. The steady increase in interest rates is slowing down the economy. BART ridership is down 60%. The San Francisco financial district is shrinking. The tech industry is laying off thousands of workers. An economic Recession is predicted by many experts.

Yet the City and State governments continue to grease the skids for all this apartment development based on their "smart growth" and "woke" ideology, not on any realistic analysis or projections.

Home prices are down 20% in Berkeley from this time one year ago. People who could afford \$6000 a month rent for an apartment in a warrant of massive development would more likely want to take the opportunity of lower home prices to buy a home.

Though Bridge is hard to pin down, there would be about 1000-1200 units built at the N. Berkeley BART station. Assuming a cost of about \$500,000 per unit, excluding interest on borrowed money, the N. Berkeley BART development could cost \$600 million. Interest rates are at a 40 year high, and are still going higher every month. Thus with interest on borrowed money included, the N. Berkeley BART development could cost \$1.5 billion or more. Yet without a clear

demand for all this rental housing, BART and Bridge could lose big. The BART Board and the City Council are blinded to reality by their growth at any cost ideology.

With nearby Cedar Rose Park over crowded on most days, the area could certainly use more park space..

The proposed BART/Bridge development would utterly dwarf and loom over the surrounding neighborhood. The noise, dust, and constant movement of heavy construction equipment would make life unbearable during the two years of construction.

BART'S MISSION STATEMENT BEING VIOLATED

According to BART's website "BART's mission is to provide safe, reliable, clean, quality transit service for riders." R Saltzman did not deny at the May 10 meeting that BART ridership is down 60%. BART should focus on honoring its Mission Statement, not in building massive and financially risky housing projects.

The North Berkeley BART development would completely surround the BART station. Riders would have to find their way through the massive housing complex to actually get to the station. Very little surface parking would remain. People would have to endure the inconvenience of parking in a high rise parking lot. The result would be a dramatic decline in BART ridership at the N. Berkeley Station

CITY & BART WANT TO CREATE A SUPERMAJORITY OF TENANTS IN BERKELEY AND THE BAY AREA

I believe that a key reason for this relentless push to build more and forever bigger apartment buildings in Berkeley and elsewhere is to create a super-majority of tenants to approve massive Bond and parcel tax measures on future ballots. Measure "L" a bond measure on the Nov 2022 Berkeley ballot would have been the largest per-capita tax in any city in the history of California. It would cost every Berkeley homeowner a minimum of \$50,000 over the years, with any low income exemption. Though it got 55% of the vote, it fortunately failed to get the necessary 2/3 vote requirement. However, with many thousands of new apartments and apartment dwellers coming to Berkeley in the next several years, I fear that there will soon be a supermajority of tenants in Berkeley pass every more punishing Bond measures and parcel taxes. By pursuing large scale apartment development at the North Berkeley and Ashby BART sites, and elsewhere, BART is helping to create a supermajority of tenants both in Berkeley and the Bay Area to approve ever more massive bond measures, including an inevitable massive BART/MTC bond measure.

SOIL CONDITIONS

A big sink hole developed at the Peralta Ave Community Garden on lease BART land several blocks from the BART lot and adjacent to the ingress/egress to the BART tunnel, a couple months ago. BART/Bridge has most likely prepared no soil studies, even though the development would be adjacent to the BART tunnel, and the ground no doubt has numerous underground streams, especially after the very heavy rains of 2022/2023.

Thank you,
Clifford Fred

Supplemental Communications

From: Jeffrey Baker <jwbaker@gmail.com>
Sent: Saturday, October 14, 2023 8:36 PM
To: Planning Commission; Berkeley Mayor's Office; All Council
Subject: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor Arreguín, members of Berkeley City Council, members of Berkeley Planning Commission, and staff members:

I am a resident of Cedar Street, near the North Berkeley BART station, and I write in wholehearted support of final objective design standards for the site which permit the greatest number of new dwellings economically achievable, with maximum flexibility reserved to the fine architects who have been selected to design the project. I support high, uniform height limits across the site, setbacks that are borrowed from the street rather than the parcel, and elimination of requirements for modulation and massing breaks.

The North Berkeley BART site is a rare opportunity in the history of our city to build a large, dense urban hub atop an existing infrastructure investment. The site does not abut any parcel less intensely developed, and it confronts low-density parcels only at great distances, up to 115 feet, across unusually wide streets. Under these circumstances, step-downs and transitions are not warranted. A uniform height limit at 85 feet will give the designers the most flexibility, and ensure the best outcome for the project.

The Draft ODS, under "Streetscape Design" proposes shrinking the site to accommodate wider sidewalks. This statement should be removed. On every side of the site there is ample room to widen the sidewalks by narrowing the street, while still leaving adequate width for travel lanes and emergency access.

Similarly, if the city wishes to have setbacks on all sides of the project, the city can simply quit-claim 5 feet of public right of way, preserving the full capacity of the site by enlarging the parcels. The city has a history of yielding excess rights of way to single-family-home projects in the hills, so I trust it will not be controversial to yield a few feet to a project of statewide importance.

The project at North Berkeley BART is meant to be transformative. The neighborhood will not be the same after it is completed. It will be a much better neighborhood, with a far larger population. Such a transformation will repudiate and counteract the "character of the surrounding built environment". Any design rule in the Draft which is justified by compatibility with the status quo should be removed, including those under "Building Massing and Articulation". These rules serve no purpose that can be in any way regarded as "objective".

I respectfully request the Commission to consider these changes at the October 18th hearing.

Sincerely,
Jeff Baker

Supplemental Communications

From: Amelia Cass <ameliacass@gmail.com>
Sent: Saturday, October 14, 2023 12:38 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Thanks,

Amelia Cass
94703

Supplemental Communications

From: Edward Opton <eopton1@gmail.com>
Sent: Saturday, October 14, 2023 10:46 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Objective Design Standards for BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

The new proposal to modify the design requirements for residential development at North Berkeley Bart bring to mind an old phrase: "bait and switch."

Don't do it.

Edward Opton

Supplemental Communications

From: Sandy Simon <sandy@traxgallery.com>
Sent: Saturday, October 14, 2023 4:01 PM
To: Planning Commission
Cc: Shen, Alisa
Subject: Objective Design Standards for BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello Berkeley City Planners!

RE: **10/18 Planning Commission public hearing on the Objective Design Standards (ODS)** for North Berkeley (and Ashby) BART sites:

If you want input from an objective spacial genius, I suggest turning to architect, Charles Debbas at Debbas architecture. charles@debbasarchitecture.com

Charles "sees" in a way many architects do not. He can create space and open areas w/o sacrificing the build.

He has won many design competitions as well as commercial and home

construction projects. He designed our home, gallery, and art studios to fit a tightly narrow space on 5th Street twenty two years ago.

Secondly, Doesn't the city know already many many apartments have been built and the vacancy is high? Why build more unless the entire project can be affordable.

Penci IN not Penci OUT>

Sincerely
Sandy Simon

Sandy Simon
Owner TRAX gallery
sandy@traxgallery.com
1812 5th Street
Berkeley, CA. 94710

Supplemental Communications

From: J. Bond <jbond35713@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 7:56 AM
To: Shen, Alisa; Planning Commission
Subject: Objective Design Standards (ODS) for North Berkeley BART site

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi:

I'm writing today to express my voice re: the Objective Design Standards (ODS) for North Berkeley BART site.

I do not support any changes to the proposed ODS that increase the size of this already too-big project. I want the City to retain the 3-story heights and the lot depths for the buildings around the Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts as it's essential to fit the development into the surrounding community.

I also want the City to keep the ODS-recommended breaks in the massing of buildings as these are vital to keep to keep this oversized project from being a fortress of building walls. In addition, the City should keep the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks (approx. 20') - with the number of people at this site and regular pedestrian traffic, having the recommended setbacks is essential.

Last, I do not support the overall proposal as it is. Even though it is now for a 3-8 story development and is down from 4 at some edges, it is STILL the same overall gigantic size.

Thank you,
Jill Bond
1246 Hearst Ave Apt 2
Berkeley, CA 94702

Supplemental Communications

From: Jordan Burns <jordanpburns13@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 3:31 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: RE: Agenda for Wednesday 18 Oct., comments on ODS proposal (Agenda item 10)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello,

I am a long time Berkeley resident living in the Berkeley hills. I am writing to ask that when writing design standards for housing at North Berkeley BART, please maximize the number of new homes that can be built as well as the walkability of the new development. I oppose using large set backs or restrictions on massing and things of that nature to limit the number of homes that can be built. I have suffered from the housing crisis since I moved here, and have seen everyone around me suffer as well. It is time to prioritize building new homes and giving more people access to public transit over the aesthetic concerns of a few rich neighbors with too much time on their hands. Maximizing the number of new homes near Bart will help our housing crisis as well as the climate crisis. Thank you for your consideration.

Jordan Burns
1114 Grizzly Peak Blvd
Berkeley, CA 94708

Supplemental Communications

From: Oren Cheyette <ocheyette@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 3:17 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: RE: Agenda for Wednesday 18 Oct., comment on ODS proposal (Agenda item 10)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commissioners -

Regarding the Objective Design Standards for the NBB housing project, I urge approval of standards to maximize the potential number of people that can be accommodated at the site. Reduce or eliminate setback requirements and site edge step downs, and avoid further limits on building heights.

Replacing five acres of pavement with transit-adjacent housing for a large number of people should be a no-brainer for a progressive city seeking to address both the local and regional housing shortage and to do its part to address climate impacts. The city can achieve both goals by maximizing the potential housing at the site, not by bending over backwards to avoid offending a few cranky neighbors.

Regards,
Oren Cheyette
Berkeley District 5

Supplemental Communications

From: Ben Gerhardstein <ben.gerhardstein@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 10:29 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

My family lives a few blocks south of the North Berkeley BART station. We look forward seeing the BART parking lots transformed into much needed transit-oriented homes.

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

- 1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks.** In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
- 2. More height = more homes.** Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
- 3. Narrow streets are slow streets.** Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Thank you

Ben Gerhardstein

Supplemental Communications

From: Jeff Hobson <jeffhobson2@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 10:51 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

I write to you as a neighbor and user of the North Berkeley BART station, someone who has gotten to or left that station on foot, bike, bus, and car over the past 23 years. I also write as a member of North Berkeley Now!

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS) with the following changes:

- 1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks.** In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
- 2. More height = more homes.** Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
- 3. Narrow streets are slow streets.** Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the Bay Area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Thank you for your work on this. I look forward to welcoming new neighbors soon to our neighborhood!

Best,
Jeff Hobson

Supplemental Communications

From: Jeannette MacMillan <macmillanjeannette@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 3:47 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Homes at North Berkeley BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Please approve objective design standards for the NB BART site that maximize housing. I'm a very close neighbor to the site, living with my family just half a block away. Please make sure that as many new people as possible can live in this wonderful neighborhood. More density = more economic diversity and less climate change.

Please include this comment in the packet for the upcoming meeting.

Thanks!

Jeannette MacMillan

Supplemental Communications

From: Alyssa Plese <plesealyssa@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 7:29 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Regards,
Alyssa Plese

Supplemental Communications

From: DAVID RICE <drice2@comcast.net>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 6:36 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Objective Design Standards for BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

It is my opinion that the Objective Design Standards (ODS) should not be changed to increase the size of the project.

It is my opinion that the three-story heights and the depths of the lots for the buildings that face Virginia St., Acton St., and Delaware street should not be changed.

It is my opinion that the breaks that the ODS recommends between the buildings be kept.

It is my opinion that the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks, which are about twenty feet as I understand it, be kept.

Thank you,

David Rice
1470 Keoncrest Drive, Berkeley, 94702

Supplemental Communications

From: Charles Siegel <siegel@preservenet.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 3:43 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: NB BART Objective Design Standards - Agenda of Oct. 18

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Commissioners:

Please approve objective design standards for NB BART development that will allow the project to proceed as planned.

Some people are trying to use the objective design standards as an excuse to reduce density, demanding larger setbacks and lower height limits. They do not understand the planning process for North Berkeley BART development: the City Council already decided on the density when it approved the zoning.

Objective design standards, as the name implies, are meant to improve the design - not to reduce the amount of housing being built. Please do not let the anti-housing, anti-environment lobby turn the Objective Design Standards into a stealth down-zoning.

Thanks,
Charles Siegel

Supplemental Communications

From: Terry Alexander <orders4tpa@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 9:38 PM
To: Planning Commission; Shen, Alisa
Subject: We support the NBNA recommendations

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Berkeley Planning Commission and Ms. Shen:

We live in the North Berkeley hills in District 6, and we frequently take BART from the North Berkeley BART station. We feel strongly that the planning for this new BART development and construction must be appropriate to the size and scale of the current neighborhood.

* * * * *

We fully support the concerns and recommendations of the NBNA:

- 1) **We reject any changes** to the proposed ODS that **increase** the size of this already too-large project.
- 2) **Please keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths** for the buildings around the Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts - it's essential to fit the development into the surrounding community.
- 3) **Please keep** the ODS-recommended **breaks in the massing of buildings** - these are vital to keep to keep this oversized project from being a fortress of building walls.
- 4) **Please keep** the ODS recommended **sidewalk setbacks** (approx. 20') - with the number of people at this site and regular pedestrian traffic, having the recommended setbacks is essential.

* * * * *

PLEASE DO NOT CHANGE THE ODS!

* * * * *

Sincerely yours,

Terry Pink Alexander
John Blaustein

Supplemental Communications

From: Ross Bernet <ross.bernet@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 7:28 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Regards,
Ross Bernet
Berkeley, D1

Supplemental Communications

From: Ranjit Bharvirkar <ranjit_rff@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 11:41 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to
- + transit, Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as
- + possible, and Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Regards,

Ranjit

Supplemental Communications

From: The-Anh Cao <theanh0413@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 7:10 PM
To: Planning Commission; Shen, Alisa
Subject: N.BERKELEY BART STATION HOUSING PROJECT

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

We all still feel the proposed project is still the same overall huge size .

We want to :

- 1) Reject any changes to the proposed ODS that increase the size of this already too-large project .
- 2) Keep the 3-story heights and lot depths for the buildings around Virginia St., Acton St., and Delaware St. fronts -
it's essential to fit the development into the surrounding community .
- 3) Keep the ODS-recommended breaks in the massing of buildings - these are vital to keep this oversized project
from the being a fortress of building walls .
- 4) Keep the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks (approx.20') - with the number of people at this site and regular
pedestrian traffic , having the recommended setbacks is essential .

Thank you ,
Mrs The-Anh Cao
1481 Virginia St.
Berkeley , CA 94702

Supplemental Communications

From: Barry Fike <barrytf@mac.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 12:17 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Agenda item 10. Wednesday 18 Oct.

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commissioners,

Please do whatever you can do to promote the building of as many homes as possible in Berkeley. I have lived in Berkeley for 61 years and have seen so many opportunities to support housing for all income levels get limited by NIMBY sentiments. Please seize this moment at North Berkeley BART and proceed full speed ahead to support building the absolute maximum.

Respectfully,
Barry Fike

1723 Allston Way
Berkeley, CA. 94703

Sent from my iPhone

Supplemental Communications

From: Ben Gould <ben@bengould.org>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 8:48 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commission,

I am writing about the proposed ODS for North Berkeley BART. I am concerned that the current draft proposal is too restrictive and would result in poor design.

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall. Massing breaks result in a strange-looking array of blocks, rather than a coherent streetscape. Paris does not have significant massing breaks and it is beautiful.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia. Four stories is not out of place across the street from single-family homes, and in fact is commonly adjacent to single-family homes even just a few blocks away, but would allow for more homes and a more consistent built environment for the sites.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes. Please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Thank you,

Ben Gould

Supplemental Communications

From: Jeff Haltiner <jeffhaltiner@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 5:54 PM
To: Shen, Alisa
Cc: Planning Commission; Haltiner Kim
Subject: ODS for NB BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

10/16/23

My wife and I are 37 yr residents of North Berkeley. We urge you not to weaken or change the ODS for this project!

To preserve the character of this wonderful part of Berkeley it is essential to design a project that integrates with the surrounding neighborhood in both size and density.

It is so damaging already to lose the parking which is essential to making BART work for most residents. Please design a smaller scale project that fits into the area.

Thank you
Jeff and Kim Haltiner
1205 Colusa Ave
Berkeley, Ca 94707

Sent from my iPhone

Supplemental Communications

From: ml hicks <mlhicks2003@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 7:48 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Objective Design Standards for BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commission:

I write to strongly encourage you to **keep the development at the North Berkeley BART station as planned by the selected developers with no increase in density or added stories** to any of the buildings. The plans released to the public look good. PLEASE keep them as they are.

Please keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths for the buildings around the Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts - it's essential to fit the development into the surrounding community.

Please keep the ODS-recommended breaks in the massing of buildings - these are vital to keep to keep this development from being a fortress of building walls.

Please keep the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks (approx. 20') - for the safety of the number of people at this site and regular pedestrian traffic.

Thank you!

Mary Lawrence Hicks
District 1 resident

Supplemental Communications

From: Michael Katz <mqkatz@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 10:05 AM
To: Planning Commission; Shen, Alisa
Subject: 10/18 Objective Design Standards for North Berkeley BART site

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Berkeley Planning Commissioners and Ms. Shen,

As a North Berkeley resident and BART rider, I urge you to firm up the proposed Objective Design Standards (ODS) to promote successful, sustainable housing development at the BART site. Please:

- 1) **Reject any changes** to the proposed ODS that would **increase** the size of this already too-large project.
- 2) **Keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths** around the Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts – these mitigations are essential to fit the development into the surrounding community.
- 3) Call for spacing and softening of the project's form and envelope. The Bridge group has presented drawings showing exactly what they've acknowledged the community has rejected: **rectangular, institutional boxes. Even the fig-leaf 3-story perimeter buildings are box-shaped.** Only toward Virginia street has Bridge showed a couple of peaked roofs on perimeter buildings. With a significant budget and the expectation of significant returns, the investors should be able to afford contemporary standards of good design. **Peaked roofs mean "home" – buildings that will be cherished, well-maintained, fully occupied, and sustainable.**
- 4) **Keep** the ODS-recommended **breaks in the massing of buildings** – these are vital to keep to keep this oversized project from being a fortress of building walls.
- 5) **Keep** the ODS recommended **sidewalk setbacks** (approx. 20'). Given the number of future residents at this site, combined with regular pedestrian traffic, the recommended setbacks are essential.
- 6) Call for the tower at the Sacramento/Virginia corner to roll back to its original proposed height of 7 stories – with no increase in setback – rather than the 8 stories that Bridge currently proposes.

Thank you for considering these suggestions toward producing a successful, sustainable project that will benefit the whole community.

Respectfully yours,
Michael Katz
Berkeley 94709

Supplemental Communications

From: Toni Mester <healthyparks@comcast.net>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 5:29 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: design standards

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

To: Planning Commission
From: Toni Mester D2
October 16, 2023

A lot of work by staff, the Planning Commission, and the public have gone into the objective standards for the North Berkeley BART station, a process that I have followed closely. I urge you to adopt the standards as presented and reject last minute changes that would alter the heights, setbacks, and street width in order to increase indoor square footage, which would decrease outdoor spaces and the quality of life for future residents, neighbors, and the general public. Outdoor gathering spaces build a sense of shared community and lessen social isolation. Setbacks and building separations provide more opportunities for benches, tables, and gathering places that enhance human interactions, as well as enjoyment of vistas, the sky, fresh air, and walking. Let's build a lovely new neighborhood and destination. Thanks for your attention and work.

Supplemental Communications

From: Leonard Mudrock <lmudrock@icloud.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 8:07 PM
To: Planning Commission; Shen, Alisa; Berkeley Mayor's Office
Cc: Leonard Mudrock
Subject: Recommendation and Street safety at North Berkeley BART.

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commission and Alisa Shen and Mayor of Berkeley,

I am deaf and a resident at Delaware Street that across the BART lot. It's hard for me to drive my car out of the driveway on Delaware Street due to increasing pedestrians and road traffic around new buildings on Delaware Street without hearing car horns. Therefore, No garage entrance of the parking building that is across from houses side. Why? because of cars' night light beams from the garage entrance to house's front window and block driveways that is NOT safe. A garage entrance should be located at either Short St of Delaware or Francisco St of Acton due to the opening area where night light beams of cars coming out. I think that the garage entrance at Francisco St of Acton seems more safe than Delaware St in order to reducing traffic flow on Delaware Street where cars would not be waiting too long to get out of the driveway on Delaware St.

Please reject any changes to the proposed ODS that increase the size of this already too-large project.
Keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths for the buildings around the Virginia St, Acton St, and Delaware St fronts.
Keep the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks (approx. 20') - with the number of people at this site and regular pedestrian traffic, having the recommended setbacks is essential.

I'd appreciate your time and consideration.

Best Regards,
Leonard Mudrock
Delaware Street resident.

Supplemental Communications

From: Alice Neels <aliceen@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 11:18 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

I'm a Berkeley resident with kids at BAM and my family walks, bikes and drives around North Berkeley BART all the time. I would love to see more housing on the site and a dense neighborhood with eyes on the street and safer streets for my kids to navigate as they grow up and get more independent.

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Regards,

Supplemental Communications

From: Andrew Nguyen <nguyen.andr.v@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 12:36 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors.

By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes: + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit, + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Regards,
Andrew Nguyen

Supplemental Communications

From: Sundrop Jewelry <tawny@sundropjewelry.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 10:41 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commissioners,

As a resident of North Berkeley living just 1 block from the N Berkeley BART station, I would like to push for the ability to build more housing at the station. Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall. While greenery is great, setbacks make much less sense for any retail/commercial on the ground floors or apartment-style housing where no individual takes ownership of the landscaping. The important thing is to make the perimeter engaging for walkability (which is also done on no-setback streets like University), not that the buildings are set back from the sidewalk.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the Bay Area housing shortage possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood. (As a car-free family, I feel walkability and bikeability are paramount, and is the entire point of building on the BART station parking lot.)

Thank you,
- Tawny Reynolds
1421 Hearst Ave
Berkeley, CA 94702

Supplemental Communications

From: Adam Rogers <jetjocko@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 2:25 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: item #10: North Berkeley BART ODS

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners:

Please make sure the objective design standards governing much-needed housing at North Berkeley BART. I'd like to see the City Council adopt an ODS with the following changes to what's on paper so far:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall. These are aesthetic decisions that'll change with trends and context, and the urgent need today is homes.
2. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia. The parking lot is going to be gone; it's going to look different no matter what. More height means more homes, more people, a more active and safer neighborhood.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of people on bikes, on foot, and generally not in cars. Plus this would make more space for homes.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Thanks for your work on all this.

Adam

--
Adam Rogers
jetjocko@gmail.com
415-244-4557

Supplemental Communications

From: mrose1126@aol.com
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 7:31 PM
To: Shen, Alisa; Planning Commission
Subject: Comment for public hearing 10/18/23 – Objective Design Standards for North Berkeley BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Ms. Shen and Planning Commission members,

I am unable to attend the Public Hearing this week, so I hope you will consider my comments here as strongly as if I were there in person! I attended the very first meeting about the North Berkeley BART site years ago at the Berkeley Adult School and I have closely followed the planning stages for the site since then. As you prepare your recommendations regarding the Objective Design Standards (ODS) for the project, I urge you NOT to weaken the proposed ODS in favor of provisions that would allow the development at North Berkeley to be larger and denser:

- In my opinion, the project is already too large for this neighborhood, so I urge you to reject any changes to the proposed ODS that increase the size of the project.
- It is vital to fit the development into the surrounding community! Keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths for the buildings around Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts.
- Keep the ODS-recommended breaks for the massing of buildings. These are crucial to prevent this oversized project from feeling like a barrier of walls.
- Keep the sidewalk setbacks (approximately 20 ft) proposed in the ODS. These setbacks are critical given the number of people that will be at this site and the regular pedestrian traffic.

I realize that the ODS don't directly affect the mass of the project, but since in my opinion the overall size of the project is already too massive for the site and for the neighborhood, I urge you to KEEP THE CURRENTLY PROPOSED ODS which are important in making the project the best that it can be!

Thank you,
Mary

Mary Rose
Delaware Street, Berkeley

Supplemental Communications

From: Vicki <vickisommer@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 9:01 PM
To: Planning Commission; Shen, Alisa
Subject: Fwd: Input for the 10/18 planning meeting re ODS for North Berkeley BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commissioners and Ms. Shen,

The North Berkeley BART station is the only BART station surrounded on four sides by a low rise residential neighborhood. If you overbuild the North Berkeley BART development you could create a “city center”, but anyone can plainly see that today, the area surrounding the station is a Neighborhood. Mischaracterized as a “city center” it was zoned for a degree of development which is excessive for the site.

People live here, have made this neighborhood their home. We are a diverse, multigenerational community. Recognizing the need for affordable housing we advocated for such housing to be built at NBB. We only asked that the development fit into the surrounding Neighborhood. Please don't make this an example of “no good deed goes unpunished”. As this is not the last site for additional housing in Berkeley there is no need to overbuild the site beyond the required 75 units per developable acre.

It seems like every time we are told that a maximal size is agreed upon, we are called into yet another meeting where this maximal size is challenged and re-challenged by interested parties wishing to make it bigger, taller, denser ... And we who live in the surrounding Neighborhood, must write these letters and attend these meetings again and again and again! This needs to stop. The project is already too tall, too dense, and nice as all the images are, it is just too big and does not fit contextually into the Neighborhood.

Regarding the proposed ODS:

- 1) **Reject any changes** to the proposed ODS that **increase** the size of this already too-large project.
 - 2) **Keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths** for the buildings around the Virginia St., Acton St. and St. fronts - it's essential to fit the development into the surrounding community.
 - 3) **Keep the ODS-recommended breaks in the massing of buildings** - these are vital to keep to keep t oversized project from being a fortress of building walls.
 - 4) **Keep the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks** (approx. 20') - with the number of people at this s regular pedestrian traffic, having the recommended setbacks is essential.
-

Thank you for your consideration,
V.Sommer
94703

Supplemental Communications

From: Vicki Sommer <vickisommer@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 7:43 PM
To: Planning Commission; Shen, Alisa
Subject: Objective Design Standards for North Berkeley BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commissioners and Ms. Shen,

Please do not weaken the proposed objective design standards to allow a larger or more dense project.

Please keep the 3 story heights and lot depths for the buildings around the Virginia, Action and Delaware st fronts. These are essential to making the development fit into the surrounding community.

Please keep the ODS - recommended breaks in the massing of buildings. Without them , this oversized project takes on the appearance of a fortress in the middle of a low rise residential neighborhood - which would be inappropriate, unsuitable and incongruous!

Please keep the ODS-recommended sidewalk setbacks (aprox 20'). This is essential to allow safe access for strollers, wheelchairs, the elderly with their assistive devices, youth whizzing around... and the vast increase in pedestrian traffic resulting from way too many people being squeezed into one city block.

Please do not misunderstand me. I support having housing here. Its just that I never dreamed that BART and the developers would be so greedy. I trusted civic leaders to advocate for existing residents and see to it that the development would fit into the neighborhood. As it stands this proposed development will already be far taller and more dense than nearby buildings on University and San Pablo avenues. These are major transit corridors and this station is surrounded on four sides by a low rise residential neighborhood! In what universe of city planning does that make any sense?!

This is not the last opportunity for affordable housing in Berkeley. 75 units per developable acre would meet the needs of Berkeley, BART and the neighborhood.

Please listen to the voices of current North Berkeley residents. The proposed development is already too big, too tall and too dense.

Thank you for your consideration,

V. Sommer
94703

Supplemental Communications

From: Anne Torney <annetorney@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 8:13 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

- 1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks.** In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
- 2. More height = more homes.** Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
- 3. Narrow streets are slow streets.** Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Sincerely,

Anne Torney
1932 Thousand Oaks Blvd
Berkeley

Supplemental Communications

From: Warren Wells <warrenjwells@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 3:24 PM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

My name is Warren Wells and I am a resident of D3 with my partner and our baby. Despite being working professionals with advanced degrees, we have a very uncertain future here in Berkeley due to the high cost of housing stemming from decades of insufficient housing production. If our city does not address the housing crisis, my family will leave and our unit will be filled with a family that makes more money than we do.

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

--

Warren J. Wells, AICP
Cell: 410-703-9898
Email: warrenjwells@gmail.com

Supplemental Communications

From: Andrea Altschuler <andreaaltschuler@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 8:01 AM
To: Planning Commission
Cc: Shen, Alisa; Kesarwani, Rashi
Subject: Accept current ODS for North Berkeley BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear City of Berkeley Planning Commissioners,

I am writing as a Berkeley resident to urge you to accept the current Objective Design Standards for the North Berkeley BART housing project.

The proposed project already is larger than what the majority of local residents expected the project to be based on early community meetings and proposed designs. It also contains buildings taller than the 7 story height limit originally recommended by City of Berkeley professional planning staff.

As such, I urge you to do the following:

- 1) **Reject any changes** to the proposed ODS that **increase** the size of this project.
- 2) **Maintain the 3-story heights and the lot depths** for the buildings around the Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts - it's essential to fit the development into the surrounding community.
- 3) **Keep** the ODS-recommended **breaks in the massing of buildings** - these are vital to keep to keep this oversized project from being a fortress of building walls.
- 4) **Keep** the ODS recommended **sidewalk setbacks** (approx. 20') - with the number of people at this site and regular pedestrian traffic, having the recommended setbacks is essential.

Sincerely,
Andrea Altschuler

Supplemental Communications

From: Marice Ashe <mariceashe@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 10:55 AM
To: Planning Commission; Shen, Alisa
Subject: Objective Design Standards for North Berkeley BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

To Whom It May Concern:

I have a few simple requests so the Planning Commission can be in sync with the community:

- The proposed project is already too big for the size of the lots and in relation to the rest of the community. Ensure it is NOT made any larger.
- Keep the frontage homes along the neighborhoods to no more than 3 stories.
- Keep open spaces and necessary visual breaks between buildings to make the project livable for humans. Jamming more buildings together ever closer and ever higher is a recipe for disaster. Maximize the buildings being human-friendly and non-oppressive.
- Keep the sidewalk setbacks as proposed. Again, this relates best to the existing community and makes the new buildings be human-friendly, not oppressive.
- The vast majority of North Berkeley residents, including me, are strongly in favor of housing on the BART property. Maximize the good faith engendered by insisting upon a beautiful new development that is respectful and enhancing of the existing neighborhood.

Marice
Marice Ashe
510-847-1655
mariceashe@gmail.com

Supplemental Communications

From: Cheryl Brewster <cbrewster2010@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 9:35 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Objective Design Standards for North Berkeley BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

It is critical that the ODS are **NOT weakened** in this already over-large project. It cannot be larger and/or denser. If you do this there will be a huge public uprising from District 1 in this residential area

1. NO CHANGES to the proposed ODS that increase the size of this project.
2. THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT: **Keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths for the building around Virginia Street.**
This is a residential street and any increase will significantly devalue the home prices on that street.
 1. District 1 Council Member stated in her monthly newsletter that the **PSH building is planned to be six stories, and will be located at the northeast corner of the site near Virginia and Sacramento streets—between Sacramento Street and the access road for the station. This is unacceptable for that corner. If the PSH building has to be 6 stories it should ONLY be on the corner of Delaware and Sacramento. NOT across from residential homes on Virginia**
3. Keep the ODS-recommended breaks in the massing of buildings...there needs to be lots of open space so that this does not look like a fortress and to be able to maintain public safety which is compromised when open visual space is diminished.
4. Keep the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks (approx 20') as this is not only a living space but a public transportation hub where lots of people are entrancing and exiting every day. Again for safety issues there needs to be open visual space.
5. This project should NOT be increased in size for any reason; it is already too large for the area and is going to look horrible in this residential area.

Cheryl Brewster
915 Hearst Ave
District 1

Supplemental Communications

From: Carol and Bruce Feldman <feldmans.bruceandcarol@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 11:08 AM
To: Shen, Alisa; Planning Commission
Subject: ODS

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

- 1) **DO NOT increase this already too lg structure**
- 2) **Keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths**
- 3) **Keep the ODS-recommended breaks in the massing of buildings -**
- 4) **Keep the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks**
- 5) PLEASE...WE DON'T WANT A DEL NORTE MONSTROSITY

Bruce & Carol Feldman

Supplemental Communications

From: Natalie Fox <natalieffox@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 7:59 AM
To: Planning Commission; Shen, Alisa
Subject: Planning Commission Public Hearing on the Objective Design Standards / North Berkeley BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

To whom it may concern at the Planning Commission:

You have asked for the public comments about the ODS for the North Berkeley BART Station. I cannot attend the meeting in person on 10/18/2023. My home is on Virginia Street and is less than a block away from the bart station. Any development at the BART station will affect my everyday life. I do not think my voice is heard nor do I think any of you care about what I have to say. It's disappointing. It's discouraging. I feel with the design plans I have seen so far, that the project is way too big. I don't think this is actually about housing or affordable housing. All I can do is write this email.

Would you want 600 new homes to be built on your street? I doubt many of you would say yes. I don't think anyone is seriously considering how any of this is going to affect the neighborhood. My neighborhood is going to bear the burden of what ends up being built for better or worse. Please continue to work with us in the neighborhood, listen to us (we live here).

Bottom line, please do not let this project become any bigger!

I reject any changes to the proposed ODS that increases the size of this already too-large project. I would prefer less than 600 units.

I would like you to keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths for the buildings around the Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts. Anything larger than 3-story really would not fit the development into the surrounding community at all.

Please keep the ODS recommended breaks in the massing of buildings. I don't want to look at a fortress everyday.

Please keep the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks (approx. 20') I believe that with the number of people at this site and regular pedestrian traffic, having the recommended setbacks is essential.

Thank you for your time,
Natalie Fox

Supplemental Communications

From: julia gee <gee.julia@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 2:43 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Opposing the development at North Berkeley to be much larger and denser

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commission Members,

Standards, by their very nature, are intended to establish firm oversight that ensure the spirit and underlying principles are implemented in a consistent manner. Only in cases where there is material community benefit should the standards be updated or exceptions granted. I do not believe this project meets these criteria.

Specifically:

- I do not believe that the community benefits from the increase in the size of this project.
- The 3-story height limit and lot depths are necessary to ensure that any development fits with the surrounding community.
- I believe the recommended breaks in the massing of buildings is necessary to prevent the project from becoming a gargantuan citadel completely out of character with the surrounding structures.
- Retain the recommended sidewalk setbacks to ensure that pedestrian traffic can safely pass.

Based on these points, I reject the proposal as not benefiting the community as a whole

Respectfully,

*Julia Gee, PE
1515 Sacramento St
Berkeley, CA*

Supplemental Communications

From: Norma Guzman <normaguz@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 8:01 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Re: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Planning Commissioners,

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall. **The existing low-density "context" is what got us into this housing shortage to begin with. Plus, if you look closely, so many homes already have makeshift ADUs and converted basements to accommodate more people -- this is evidence that we need as many homes as possible!**
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia. **Heights are beautiful! The new buildings along Shattuck are creating visually interesting valleys, a sense of arrival, and are making Berkeley feel like it is part of the 21st century! More height please!**
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this. **Narrow streets by adding allees of trees (esp native CA trees) to increase the canopy in this bare part of town. Trees improve air quality, cool our neighborhoods, and narrow the field of vision for drivers, encouraging them to slow down.**

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Regards,

Norma Guzman

Supplemental Communications

From: Andrea Horbinski <andrea.horbinski@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 9:12 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Item #10: North Berkeley BART Objective Design Standards (ODS)

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Planning Commissioners,

I'm concerned about the current draft North Berkeley BART ODS. This is a priceless opportunity to rectify some of the damage done to the neighborhood by the construction of BART as a car-oriented service 50 years ago and more needs to be done to maximize the number of new homes built on the site.

Please recommend that City Council adopt the North Berkeley BART ODS with the following changes:

1. Reduce setbacks and massing breaks. In its current form, the ODS setbacks and massing breaks lead to fewer family-sized homes and fewer homes overall.
2. More height = more homes. Bring the overall height up to 85 feet and increase the height to four stories for the stepped-down perimeter along Delaware, Acton, and Virginia.
3. Narrow streets are slow streets. Delaware and Virginia need to be narrowed for the safety of pedestrians AND it will make more space for homes so please add a recommendation to include this.

These changes will ensure flexibility in the ODS so that North Berkeley BART's architects and designers can make a nice place to live for our future neighbors. By approving a flexible ODS, you will help ensure these positive changes:

- + Maximize the number of climate change-fighting homes adjacent to transit,
- + Put the biggest dent in the bay area housing shortage as possible, and
- + Maintain the walkable and bikeable character of our transit-oriented neighborhood.

Thank you. I look forward to as many new neighbors as possible moving into these homes once the above changes are made.

Regards,

Andrea Horbinski, PhD
<https://ahorbinski.com/>

Supplemental Communications

From: Laura García-Moreno <lauragarmor@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 12:58 AM
To: Planning Commission; Shen, Alisa

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

To the Berkeley planning committee,

I am not in Berkeley at the moment and will not be able to attend the Special Planning Commission public hearing on the Objective Design Standards for the North Berkeley Bart site this evening. However, as someone who lives right across the NB Bart station, I am very concerned about the size of this project, so I want to insist on not making it any bigger than it already is.

1. **Keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths** for the buildings around the Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts.
2. **Keep the ODS-recommended breaks in the massing of buildings** - these are vital to keep to keep this oversized project from being a fortress of building walls.
3. **Keep the ODS recommended sidewalk setbacks** (approx. 20').

A fortress looking building does not help to create a healthy community which needs breathing space.

Thanks for listening,
Laura García Moreno

Supplemental Communications

From: Phyllis Orrick <poberkeley@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 11:19 AM
To: Covello, Zoe; Humbert, Mark; Jeffrey Baker; Kesarwani, Rashi; North Berkeley Now!; Planning Commission; Robinson, Rigel; Taplin, Terry
Subject: Maximize homes and minimize roads in NBB ODS

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear commissioners, staff and councilmembers,

I live a five-minute walk from NBB and pass it at least 30 times a month on my bike running errands and visiting friends. I have lived here for nearly 30 years and am appalled at our city's abandonment of a couple of generations who have been forced away because of high housing costs.

I am writing one more time to counter what I expect will be a last-gasp barrage of neighborhood "preservationists" trying to scuttle much of what is needed to make a transformative change for the better in Berkeley.

The ODS for NBB must be structured so the developers can build the largest number of units with the greatest feasible share of family-friendly units and affordable ones.

That means raising the height and easing setback and massing break requirements.

I support high, uniform height limits across the site, setbacks that are borrowed from the street rather than the parcel, and elimination of requirements for modulation and massing breaks.

The extra height also means the Ohlone Greenway will get more open space to become a public recreational spot as it is to the east across the street.

The North Berkeley BART site is a rare opportunity in the history of our city to build a large, dense urban hub atop an existing infrastructure investment. The site does not abut any parcel less intensely developed, and it confronts low-density parcels only at great distances, up to 115 feet, across unusually wide streets. Under these circumstances, step-downs and transitions are not warranted. A uniform height limit at 85 feet will give the designers the most flexibility, and ensure the best outcome for the project.

The Draft ODS, under "Streetscape Design" proposes shrinking the site to accommodate wider sidewalks. This statement should be removed. On every side of the site there is ample room to widen the sidewalks by narrowing the street, while still leaving adequate width for travel lanes and emergency access.

Similarly, if the city wishes to have setbacks on all sides of the project, the city can simply quit-claim 5 feet of public right of way, preserving the full capacity of the site by enlarging the parcels. The city has a history of yielding excess rights of way to single-family-home projects in the hills, so I trust it will not be controversial to yield a few feet to a project of statewide importance.

The project at North Berkeley BART is meant to be transformative. The neighborhood will not be the same after it is completed. It will be a much better neighborhood, with a far larger population. Such a transformation will repudiate and counteract the "character of the surrounding built environment". Any design rule in the Draft which is justified by compatibility with the status quo should be removed, including those under "Building Massing and Articulation". These rules serve no purpose that can be in any way regarded as "objective".

Berkeley is in danger of becoming a hollowed out city: with either older residents who can't afford to move or younger ones who have access to enough wealth to pay the going prices for single family homes.

We need homes for the missing middle: teachers, retail workers, firefighters, mail carriers, sanitation workers, police officers, school employees, etc. Many of these are forced to live outside the city and hence drive to their jobs, creating stress on them and their families due to long commutes, and stress on our streets due to traffic and parking.

If those who work in Berkeley can afford to live here, our city will become a much more humane, and vibrant, place.

I respectfully request the Commission to consider these changes at the October 18th hearing.

—Phyllis Orrick

Supplemental Communications

From: Margaret <margaretpritt@sbcglobal.net>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 10:10 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Objective Design Standards for BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi,

In regard to the North Berkeley BART proposed development:

Do not build any parts higher than 8 stories.

Have all buildings set back from the sidewalks.

Have all buildings along the residential streets restricted to 3 stories.

Any deviation from this will be a detriment to those homeowners who have been living in their homes & paying taxes to the city of Berkeley, some for decades!

Thank You,
Margaret Pritt

Sent from my iPhone

Supplemental Communications

From: Francie Shaw <shawfrancie@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 8:09 AM
To: Shen, Alisa; Planning Commission; North Berkeley Neighborhood Alliance
Subject: ODS for BART comment

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

I feel duped by this process. You had a fairly positive response to the earlier presentation I went to at the Berkeley Adult School. Now you get down to the real business and stop being nice.

1. **The grace notes** of the design, that made it somewhat palatable, **disappeared**, the community walkways and public space. That was probably your intention all along. Even if it wasn't, it has the same effect of neutralizing the public hearings, what a charade, you should be ashamed of yourselves. as we thought it was a somewhat sane plan.

2. The current plan adds **more cars**, more height and the **really ugly current BART station as the central visual** feature. This is *such* horrible planning.

3. And you now privilege cars more. **Why a street in the middle** of the developement suddenly? I know there is a need for BART riders to get off and on buses, but what about the long tedious upgrade just finished on Sacramento St? That goes in the waste basket? Can't BART riders walk or roll a short distance, less than a 1/2 block? A street in the middle of the housing is a backward looking vision.

4. **The ugly old BART station stays?** That is a huge waste of space. Can't it change a bit? Make something more useful and interesting please, what a lost opportunity if you don't. I mean, really, it looks really really pathetic there.

5. **Height.** Is there another big surprise coming at the end of the public planning process? People aren't just bodies in a housing plan. We are all a community, at least I hope so. **The tall buildings along Shattuck and other major street are an unfair comparison.** And I think you know

that. The taller a development goes the more it would be a separate entity, like the miserably failed housing projects of the sixties.

6. I applaud affordable housing. But I'm not sure I trust your numbers, they always seem like **tentative numbers**.

And you seem to leave out the nice parts to get the space. Don't low income people deserve nice housing too? Isn't that what is our central concern in this housing climate.

Francie Shaw

1631 Grant St Berkeley

Supplemental Communications

From: Susan Thompson <susanthompsonmft@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 7:07 AM
To: Planning Commission
Subject: Objective Design Standards for BART

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

To Whom It May Concern,

I write to express my concern over the North Berkeley BART building project and my support of not changing the proposed ODS. Neither building height, setbacks, breaks between buildings etc. so it becomes a resource not a blight.

I see Now Leasing signs all over Berkeley, and BART ridership has declined significantly due to less office commuting. So many people work from home now, and it's hard to have faith that these units will really be affordable.

Thank you for your time,
Susan Thompson, Berkeley Resident

Sent from my iPhone

Supplemental Communications

From: meryl siegal <merylsiegal@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 8:12 AM
To: Planning Dept. Mailbox; Shen, Alisa
Subject: BART Planning - Key points for tomorrow night's meeting 10/18

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Alisa Shen and the Planning Commission:

Do not at all weaken the objective design standards for the North Berkeley BART project to allow a larger project. The promise to us in the surrounding community was contextualized building, and we expect the city to uphold that promise.

The following guidelines should be followed:

- **3-story heights and the lot depths** for the buildings around the Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts because it was promised to the community, the community has said over and over it wants the step down, and going against what the community wants and needs for continuity in the larger neighborhood is essential for honoring your promise to us in D1.
- This is public land in Berkeley, California! Make it a showcase for the future. It must be built to not look like a concrete monolith from the Soviet Era building. **Keep** the ODS-recommended **breaks in the massing of buildings** so that what is built does not look like a fortress, or a "project" but a living, breathing space.
- **Keep** the ODS recommended **sidewalk setbacks** (approx. 20') so that people, and wheelchairs, walkers, --- all people --- can achieve regular free pedestrian traffic on this site.
- Create housing for victims of domestic or gender violence, and single women with children. It is time, and it is this sector of the homeless population that Berkeley needs to respond to.

We are already losing parking. D1 neighborhoods will be deluged with parking and in some cases, for the over 65 and disabled folks, parking will be necessary. Please create a project that provides open space, beauty, and serenity.

Create the best for the upcoming decades.

Sincerely,

Meryl Siegal

Supplemental Communications

From: tom reilly <tom.reilly46@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 15, 2023 2:23 PM
To: Shen, Alisa; All Council
Subject: Design Standards for North Berkeley BART site

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Ms. Shen and Mr. Mayor and the members of the City Council:

I understand that the City is seeking input again upon the proposed development of the North Berkeley BART site. I have gone on record many times to say that I believe the proposed development is too large for the site and the neighborhood and that a smaller project with a much greater percentage of affordable housing would be more appropriate. However, if the larger project is to be built as proposed, I would urge at least that the Objective Design Standards (ODS) that have already been proposed to the neighborhood be retained.

I therefore urge that the Council:

- 1) **Reject any changes** to the proposed ODS that **increase** the size of this already too-large project.
- 2) **Keep the 3-story heights and the lot depths** for the buildings around the Virginia St., Acton St. and Delaware St. fronts - it's essential to fit the development into the surrounding community.
- 3) **Keep** the ODS-recommended **breaks in the massing of buildings** - these are vital to keep to keep this oversized project from being a fortress of building walls.
- 4) **Keep** the ODS recommended **sidewalk setbacks** (approx. 20') - with the number of people at this site and regular pedestrian traffic, having the recommended setbacks is essential.

Very truly yours,

Tom Reilly
1450 Keoncrest Drive
Berkeley CA 94702

Supplemental Communications

From: julia gee <gee.julia@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 2:43 AM
To: Shen, Alisa
Subject: ODS for BART comment

WARNING: This is not a City of Berkeley email. Do not click links or attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Ms. Shen,

Standards, by their very nature, are intended to establish firm oversight that ensure the spirit and underlying principles are implemented in a consistent manner. Only in cases where there is material community benefit should the standards be updated or exceptions granted. I do not believe this project meets these criteria.

Specifically:

- I do not believe that the community benefits from the increase in the size of this project.
- The 3-story height limit and lot depths are necessary to ensure that any development fits with the surrounding community.
- I believe the recommended breaks in the massing of buildings is necessary to prevent the project from becoming a gargantuan citadel completely out of character with the surrounding structures.
- Retain the recommended sidewalk setbacks to ensure that pedestrian traffic can safely pass.

Based on these points, I reject the proposal as not benefiting the community as a whole

Respectfully,

Julia Gee, PE
1515 Sacramento St
Berkeley, CA